

HORTON HEALTH OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE - 4 JULY 2019

Chairman's Report

1. Scoring Panel Observation

- 1.0 As part of the Oxfordshire Clinical Commissioning Group (OCCG) and Oxford University Hospitals NHS Trust (OUH) response to address the outcome of the referral to the Secretary of State, a scoring panel group met on 3rd June 2019 to consider the options for obstetrics at the Horton. A Horton HOSC member and Policy Officer supporting the committee attended the session to observe.
- 1.1 The session was independently chaired and attended by senior key health system partners and stakeholders, including Keep the Horton General campaign group. Members of the panel had been sent an information pack ahead of time and asked to independently score the options for obstetrics at the Horton against the criteria established. The panel were not made aware of the weighting of each criteria ahead of time, to ensure there was no bias in the scoring. The session brought together those scores with the intention of reaching an agreed consensus score.
- 1.2 The group agreed to use a 'mode' (rather than median or mean) method of scoring the options. The group spent time discussing reasons for scoring where consensus had not been reached and every member of the panel conceded on at least one area to ensure agreement was reached. The Keep the Horton General campaign group refused to score ahead of time, however did take part in discussions around scoring in the session. During discussions it was noted that there were difficulties to score some areas due to insufficient information. There was also a discussion around some individuals scoring based on their expertise and knowledge of the area, as opposed to just using the information present. A small number of areas were left unscored to allow additional information to be gathered. The information was obtained and an extra session held on 12th June to complete the scoring.

2. Stakeholder Events:

- 2.1 As part of the Oxfordshire Clinical Commissioning Group (OCCG) and Oxford University Hospitals NHS Trust (OUH) response to address the outcome of the referral to the Secretary of State, two stakeholder events were held on the 22nd February 2019 and the 14th June 2019. The purpose of these meetings was at the first, explore and determine the weighting which should be applied to the scoring criteria on options for obstetrics at the Horton General Hospital. This process is described in Appendix A of this report. The second meeting, on the 14th of June then played back the outcome of the scoring panel where the options were considered against the criteria (described above).

2.2 Both of the stakeholder events were attended by a member of Horton HOSC along with a Policy officer supporting the committee. It is understood that the CCG Board will be deciding on the preferred option in September. The point was underlined in the session on the 14th of June 2019 that the decision making will not centre solely around the list of scored options, it will also take account of a number of other factors including the experiences that a number of mothers shared at the December 2018 Horton HOSC meeting. The session also captured a number of questions and challenges from stakeholders.

3. Independent advice

3.1 During the Horton HOSC meeting of the 11th of April 2019, members agreed to: “*Seek independent advice of the possibility of the timing, costs and feasibility of appointing of our own consultants to clinically evaluate the options*”.

3.2 In response to this request, a specification for the work was developed and then distributed to suppliers, including the Royal College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists, two Commissioning and Support Units and three health consultancy firms. The specification set out the following aims and objectives:

The Horton HOSC wishes to undertake a thorough review to ensure all possible options for provision of consultant-led obstetric services at the Horton General Hospital have been independently exhausted and robustly evaluated. The aim of the proposed review is to:

Independently and clinically evaluate the options for provision of obstetric services at the Horton General Hospital.

To achieve this it is requested that.

- The evidence presented to the [Horton HOSC in its public meetings](#) is reviewed against the clinical and quality standards expected for the delivery of obstetric services;
- The [options](#) presented to the Horton HOSC are each independently evaluated for their feasibility, patient safety, patient experience (including travel and access), clinical quality and cost. This must include an evaluation of the impact of the options on health inequalities.
- Any models or options not considered through the Horton HOSC process are identified and evaluated.
- Independent, clinical recommendations are made on the options most suitable for obstetric provision at the Horton General Hospital.

3.3 The initial request for expressions of interest was made with a short time frame and all suppliers declined to submit a bid due to the tight deadlines involved (June 2019). In response to this, the deadlines and timescale for providing independent feedback was then extended (to September). All suppliers declined submitting a bid for this work because the timescales are too short for the planning and work required.